



**ANALYZING HIGHER ORDER THINKING SKILLS (HOTS) QUESTIONS OF
READING ESSAY TASK IN SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL ENGLISH TEXTBOOK**

THESIS

**BY:
MAZIYYATUS SHALIHAH
NPM 21902073023**



**UNIVERSITY OF ISLAM MALANG
POSTGRADUATE PROGRAM
ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM
JANUARY 2022**

ABSTRAK

Tugas membaca secara komprehensif dikenal sebagai tugas yang kompleks di antara tugas-tugas keterampilan lainnya karena penyelesaiannya perlu menguasai kosakata sebagai komponen bahasa Inggris; sedangkan kosa kata adalah komponen yang paling penting untuk dikuasai dalam mempelajari bahasa apapun supaya mahir dalam seluruh keterampilan. Buku teks bahasa Inggris khususnya tingkat Sekolah Menengah Atas harus terdiri dari berbagai tugas membaca bahasa Inggris yang berkualitas untuk meningkatkan kemampuan bahasa Inggris siswa dengan melatih membaca dan penguasaan kosakata sekaligus.

Fakta-fakta tersebut mendorong peneliti untuk melakukan penelitian kualitatif dalam hal analisis karena peneliti hanya berfokus pada tugas membaca esai bahasa Inggris dari buku teks bahasa Inggris Sekolah Menengah Atas. Tujuan penelitian ini mencakup satu pertanyaan penelitian yaitu; “Bagaimana Pendistribusian Soal Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) dalam Soal Esai di buku teks SMK/MAK Bahasa Inggris untuk kelas X, XI, dan XII?”. Dalam hal ini peneliti memilih buku teks bahasa Inggris SMA untuk kelas X, XI, dan XII oleh BUMI AKSARA dengan memanfaatkan program K13 untuk mengetahui seberapa tinggi persentase soal HOTS yang terdistribusi dalam buku teks tersebut, karena soal HOTS dapat meningkatkan kemampuan berpikir kritis siswa. .

Langkah-langkah analisis diselesaikan secara berurutan mulai dari observasi buku teks, pemilihan pertanyaan, reduksi data, dan terakhir menganalisis data HOTS yang terkumpul. Dari analisis data diperoleh 9% dengan 6 soal HOTS reading essay (C4:2, C5:4) di buku teks bahasa Inggris kelas X, 6% dengan 7 soal HOTS reading essay (C4:5, C5:2) dalam bahasa Inggris buku ajar kelas XI, dan 10% dengan 12 soal esai bacaan HOTS (C5:12) di buku teks bahasa Inggris kelas XII. Temuan ini menunjukkan bahwa soal esai LOTS lebih terdistribusi dengan baik daripada HOTS.

Dari temuan tersebut dapat disimpulkan bahwa, soal HOTS reading essay berdistribusi lebih sedikit daripada LOTS. Hasil faktual ini merekomendasikan semua guru bahasa Inggris untuk selektif dalam memanfaatkan buku teks bahasa Inggris karena dapat meningkatkan pemikiran kritis siswa. Selain itu, peneliti menyarankan peneliti selanjutnya untuk meneliti pengaruh HOTS terhadap prestasi belajar siswa.

ABSTRACT

Reading comprehension task is well-known as a complex task among other skill tasks since its completion needs to master vocabulary as English component; while vocabulary is the most important component to master in learning any languages to be proficient at the whole skills. Furthermore, English textbook especially senior high school must consist of qualified English reading tasks in order to boost students' english skills by being trained with reading and vocabulary mastery at once.

Those facts drove the researcher to do a qualitative research in term of analysis since the researcher just focuses on the English essay reading tasks of senior high school English textbook. This purpose of study is covered by one research question to figure out; "how are Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) questions of essay reading exercises distributed in English SMK/ MAK textbook for X, XI, and XII grades?". To cover up this question, the researcher selected senior high school English textbook for X, XI, and XII grades by BUMI AKSARA utilizing K13 program to find out how high percentage HOTS questions are distributed within the textbook since HOTS questions could upgrade students' critical thinking.

Analysis steps were sequentially completed started from textbook observation, question selection, data reduction, and finally analyzing the HOTS data collected. From the data analysis, there obtained 9% with 6 HOTS reading essay questions (C4:2, C5:4) in English textbook of X grade, 6% with 7 HOTS reading essay questions (C4:5, C5:2) in English textbook of XI grade, and 10% with 12 HOTS reading essay questions (C5:12) in English textbook of XII grade. This finding shows that LOTS reading essay questions are well-distributed more than HOTS.

From those findings can be concluded that, HOTS reading essay questions are distributed less than LOTS. These factual results recommend all English teachers to be selective in utilizing English textbook due to improving students' critical thoughts. Also, the researcher suggests the further researcher to investigate HOTS effects on students' achievement.

Keywords: Reading Essay Task, and HOTS (Higher Order Thinking Skills)

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

In this chapter the researcher primarily presents the background of study, research questions, and the objectives of the research. Further, the significance of the study, scope and limitation, definition of key term are also reported to give obvious information about the research.

1.1. Background of the Study

In recent global educational system, cognitive skill is a priority to be taught to individuals because it plays a crucial role in every domain of life to make people think critically, more focus, and attentive about the problem around them. Education in the demand of 21st century comes with the need of thinking ability which is called as higher-order thinking skills (HOTS) (Mursyid & Kurniawati, 2019). Higher-Order Thinking Skill (HOTS) refers to thinking on a level that is higher than memorizing facts or telling something back to someone (Fakhomah & Utami, 2019). Higher-Order Thinking Skills reinforce students to develop their critical thinking which can also upgrade their skills and values then apply their knowledge for solving problem and making right decision. One of the goals of learning through HOTS is to make sure that students can analyze, evaluate, and create their knowledge (Ariyana et al, 2018)

The recent curriculum of Indonesia, called as Curriculum 2013, upgrades its content by attracting more on students' needs of analytical and critical thinking which appropriate to International Standard. In assessing thinking skills in education, Bloom's Taxonomy is the most broadly recognized, those are; knowledge, comprehension, application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation (Valdev Singh & Shaari, 2019). On the other hand, Anderson and Krathwohl (2001) revised the Bloom's Taxonomy into six categories those are remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating and creating. The first three (remembering, understanding, applying) are regarded as Lower Order Thinking Skills (LOTS), while the second three (analyzing, evaluating, creating) are Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS).

In response to this issue, Ministry of Education and Culture tried to integrate HOTS in the existing curriculum which is 2013 curriculum (Kemendikbud, 2017). As the result, all the stakeholders in educational fields need to support the goal of curriculum 2013 in which students have to have higher order thinking skills. The best solution in improving students' higher order thinking skills is by applying it in the teaching learning process. As the fact, there are three main elements that correlate one another in the classroom, those are; teachers, students, and textbook. Teachers as facilitator has essential role in encouraging students to implement their higher order thinking skills (HOTS). It means that, teachers have to give more HOTS questions whether orally or contextually. Contextual question could be from English textbook used by students and teachers in the learning process in which it can be one of instructional material that develop students' higher order thinking

skills.

Furthermore, in the teaching and learning process, text book has a significant role for teachers and students' development in understanding the materials. Textbook is claimed as a central guidance for both teachers and students in order to create a meaningful, active, and efficient teaching and learning process. It can decide what teachers should teach and what students need to learn in which teachers could provide appropriate materials to the students systematically. Febriani (2020) believed that the presence of textbook could motivate students in achieving the target of learning objective. In line with this, Harmer (2007) stated that teachers and students will get benefits from the use of textbook such getting clear explanation and its exercises in each chapter.

In addition, Nanda et al (2019) emphasized on her research that printed learning media such textbook, are economically more affordable and cheaper for both students and teachers. Therefore, textbooks claimed as economical, effective, and efficient media in the teaching process. Teacher could easily use textbook as media for developing the teaching materials. For students, textbooks are practical, readable, and loads of multimedia present in the textbook such as texts, pictures, and graphics. However, textbooks require some characteristics such as; it has needs, interest, and students' abilities, accommodate the teacher, and meet the needs of official teaching syllabus.

However, criticism for English textbook occurs in educational matter because of the low quality of the content itself. Some of those critics insist on the limited material exist in the English textbook in which the content is not sufficiently

challenging for the students and the teacher. In line with Anasy (2016) claims that many textbooks still become problematic in the implementation of HOTS caused by some of exercise in the textbook contain only few of higher order thinking skills (HOTS) exercises. As the matter of fact, some of the exercises presented in the textbook are inconsistent with the level of students and also not reflect to the characteristic of curriculum 2013 that requires students to have critical thinking (Ilma, 2018). Thus, the teachers have to analyze and evaluate the textbook once it is provided to the students. The relevant content of the textbook need to be confirmed and evaluated by the teacher whether or not the textbook is suitable with students' level, instructional objective, and more importantly the textbook contains Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS).

Ironically, there are several teachers indicate their dependency on textbook in the classroom. Also, many Indonesian teachers do not have time to develop their own learning material for teaching English. Consequently, some of them depend on the textbook which is usually recommended by the publishing company or it is because of the book approved by the Ministry of Education. Although, the Ministry of Education and Culture has released some appropriate textbooks that proper for teaching learning process then made some regulations in designing, using, and evaluating the textbook. However, doing evaluation on English textbook still need to be conducted as long as textbook as the teaching and learning guidance in the classroom.

At that point, textbook which contain higher order thinking skills (HOTS) questions have a crucial role in developing students' critical thinking. Igarria

(2014) claim that textbook is an essential source which provides the structural activities that could encourage students' level of thinking. It is not only transferring knowledge or information rather than promoting and improving higher order thinking process. The content of textbook consists of materials and activities or exercises in which those are essential aspects in encouraging students' level of thinking. Margana & Widyanoro (2017) suggested that the exercises in textbook should be designed in order to lead students to be critical thinkers. It can be assumed that textbook is one teaching materials that could enhance students' critical thinking. Therefore, for textbook authors and publishers should provide some exercises that could stimulate students' level thinking such as analyzing, evaluating, and creating that could emphasize students' HOTS.

In the evaluation of textbook, there are several aspects need to be considered those are; exercises, the books' lay out, books' instruction, teaching materials, and so on. As the fact, all stakeholders of education and all users of textbook have had responsibility in evaluating textbook. One of the crucial aspects that need to be evaluated is the exercises. Exercises in the textbook have a significant role in learning English because it helps students to apply their skills and get better result in the learning process. Also, it is useful for teachers to know the students' understanding of teaching materials and their four language skills. One of the important skills for students is reading. Reading is clearly one of important language skills that students have to read English materials for their subject. Students often thought to be easier to obtain information from written text by reading.

Reading comprehension becomes the most necessary skill to get information for students because by reading comprehension they get a lot of knowledge from the textbook and help them to understand the teaching materials or even solve their problems in studying (Riadi & Tantra, 2020). In addition, some of researches believe that critical thinking and reading activities are linked one another (Beck, 1989; Ruggiero, 1984; Yu-hui et al., 2010 in Yoke et al 2015). In reading activities, students have to utilize all levels of thinking to have better result in answering all reading exercises. In EFL classroom, critical reading is indicated by the ability to answer Higher Order Thinking (HOT) items presented in the textbook.

In fact, the researcher found some exercises of textbooks still provide Lower Order Thinking Skills (LOTS). It is proven by study from Febriyani, Yunita, & Damayanti (2020). This study focused on the composition of higher order thinking skills (HOTS) that present in language task or the four skills (listening, speaking, reading, and writing) in “*Bahasa Inggris SMA/ MA/ SMK/ MAK kelas XII edisi revisi 2018*” textbook. The study found that the textbook is more dominant LOTS (lower Order Thinking Skills) rather than higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS).

Besides, study from Mizbani (2017) found that all the activities of speaking and listening skill in the textbook categorized as low level of cognitive domain in which it could not train students to perform their critical thinking.

From both of the studies reviewed on all language skills in the textbook and productive skill such as speaking and listening skill. However, this current research focuses on analyzing essay reading exercises in the textbook. In line with this,

Airasian and Russel (2008) state that essay questions approve the students in creating unique feedback that support the development of their critical thinking because in answering like essay questions, the students need an effort to compose their own words.

For this reason, the researcher needs to evaluate more on essay reading exercises on another textbook that used in the classroom. In this research, the writer would like to analyze the contribution of higher order thinking skills in essay reading exercises of “*English SMK/ MAK edisi revisi 2017*” textbook for all grades (X, XI, XII) of Senior High School students which one of numerous English textbooks based on curriculum 2013.

1.2. Statements of the Problems

Confirming to the previous studies and background of study, the researcher proposes a research question “How are Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) in essay reading exercises distributed in *English SMK/ MAK* textbook for X, XI, and XII grades?”

1.3. Objectives of the Study

Based on the statement above, the current study aims to obtain empirical evidence to the distribution of Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) in essay reading exercises distributed in *English SMK/ MAK* textbook for X, XI, and XII grades.

1.4. The Significance of the Study

There are two significances of this study; theoretical and practical significances. For the theoretical significance, this study is expected to give a broader insight or perception about the textbook selection, the reading exercises, and the higher order thinking skills from the revised edition of Bloom's Taxonomy.

For practical significance, this study is conducted in order to give information to the teachers: needs to provide better insight on how to select and choose the better English textbook in teaching learning activity. The teacher will get more knowledge and sufficient information about effective teaching learning environment by raising questions that raise students' critical thinking abilities and understand the hidden concepts. Besides, it can be used as a basic consideration for the next researchers who are interested in developing similar study.

1.5. The Scope and Limitation of the Study

To specify this study, the scope of this study focused on the essay questions in reading exercises of "*English SMK/ MAK*" for X, XI, and XII grades published by Bumi Aksara the third edition. Those exercises are analyzed according to the levels of six cognitive domains from the revised edition of Bloom's taxonomy that includes remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating, and creating.

Due to the time constraint and the pandemic situation, the researcher only analyzes the English textbook without investigating students or teachers' perception on Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) on the textbook. Ideally, students or

teachers' perception also needed to get more comprehensive knowledge about HOTS in English textbooks.

1.6. Definition of Key Terms

a. Higher Order Thinking Skill

Higher order thinking skill is an educational concept reform based on revised Bloom's taxonomies. In this concept cognitive is more required to be applied in which it needs higher level of thinking than just restating facts or memorization. By this means all the essay questions in ENGLISH textbook have to contain of critical questions which could train students' critical and analytical thinking.

b. English Textbook

English text book is a textbook used by teacher as an instructional book in the classroom during the learning process. This book published by Bumi Aksara the third edition 2017 entitled "ENGLISH SMK/ MAK".

c. Essay Reading Exercises

Essay reading exercises here means all essay questions in "English SMK/ MAK" textbook for Senior High School students. The questions here are questions that begin with WH questions (What, Who, When, Where, Why, How). It could measure the students' thinking level to response the exercises that consist of Higher Order Thinking Skill. Those exercises require the students to use their thinking in more complicated process.



CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

This chapter presents the conclusion of this study and some suggestion dedicated to English teachers and further researcher.

6.1. Conclusion

In conclusion of all findings and discussion in the previous chapter about HOTS analysis of reading essay tasks in English textbook of X, XI, and XII grade, this study found LOTS more frequently implemented than HOTS in the reading tasks especially essay task which becomes the focus of this study. Specifying the HOTS which has 3 domains “*C4 (Analyzing), C5 (Evaluating), and C6 (Creating)*”, every grade of English textbook (X, XI, XII) has different dominant domain of HOTS question in reading essay. In details, the distributions of HOTS in every grade X, XI, XII based on the three domains (analyzing, evaluating, and creating) are as follows;

1. Grade X
 - a) C5 (evaluating) has the highest distribution in English text book grade X with 4 questions/66.7%
 - b) C4 (analyzing) obtained 2 questions/33.3%
 - c) C6 (creating) is not implemented in English textbook grade X
2. Grade XI

- a) C4 (analyzing) places the first highest distribution in English textbook grade XI with 5 questions/71.4%
- b) C5 (evaluating) gained 2 questions/28.6%
- c) C6 (creating) obtained zero

3. Grade XII

- a) C5 (evaluating) obtained 12 questions/100% distributed in English textbook grade XII
- b) C4 (analyzing) gained zero
- c) C6 (creating) obtained zero

6.2. Suggestion

Every research conducted might have significance of study to contribute solutions of any problems encountered. Since this study focused on HOTS analyses in a textbook, the suggestions are forwarded to;

1. English Teachers

All the English teachers are recommended to be more selective to pick an English textbook reversed to the importance of reading skill toward other skills improvement and the benefits of HOTS questions. Another way, the teachers are suggested to create and develop their own questions using HOTS domains.

2. Future Researchers

While there have been a lot of studies about HOTS analyses in any kinds of handouts or textbooks, the researcher suggests the next researcher to investigate HOTS effects on students' achievement by comparing those students who got more



HOTS question treatments with those students who got more LOTS question treatments.



REFERENCE

- Airasian, P. W & Russell, M. K. (2008). *Classroom Assessment: Concepts and Applications 6th Ed.* Boston: McGraw-Hill.
- Anderson, L.W. & Krathwohl, D.R. (2001). *A taxonomy for learning, teaching, and assessing: A revision of Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives (Complete edition)*. New York: Longman.
- Anasy, Z. (2016). HOTS (Higher Order Thinking Skills) in reading exercise. *Tarbiya: Journal of Education in Muslim Society*, 3(1), 51–63. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.15408/tjems.v3il.3886>
- Ariyana, Y., Bestary, R., & Mohandas, R. (2018). *Buku pegangan pembelajaran berorientasi pada ketrampilan berpikir tingkat tinggi*. Jakarta: Direktorat Jenderal Guru dan Tenaga Kependidikan Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Ary, D. (2010). *Introduction to Research in Education*. Belmont: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.
- Assaly, I & Igbaria, A.K. (2014). A Content Analysis of The Reading and Listening Activities in The EFL Textbook of Master Class. *Education Journal*. 3(2), 24-38.
- Brookhart, S. M. (2010). *How to assess higher-order thinking skills in your classroom*. Alexandria, VA: ASCD
- Caldwell, J. (2008). *Comprehension Assessment*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Collins, R. (2014). Skills for the 21st Century: teaching higher-order thinking. *Curriculum & Leadership Journal*, 12(14)
- Crossland, J., (2015). Thinking Skills and Bloom's Taxonomy. *Primary Science*, 32-34.
- Cunningworth, A. (1995). *Choosing Your Coursebook*. Oxford. MacMillan: Publisher Limited
- Duffy, G.G. (2009). *Explaining reading. A resource for teaching concepts, skills, and strategies*. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Fakhomah, D. N., & Utami, M. S. (2019). Pre-Service English Teacher Perception About Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) in the 21st Century Learning. *International Journal of Indonesian Education and Teaching*.
- Fauziyati & Endang. (2015). *Teaching English as a Foreign Language: Principle and Practice*. Surakarta: Era Pustaka Utama
- Febrina, F, Usman, B., & Muslem, A. (2019). Analysis of Reading Comprehension Questions by Using Revised Bloom's Taxonomy on Higher Order Thinking Skill (HOTS). *English Education Journal*. 10 (01), 1-15
- Febriani, A, R. Yunita, W. & Damayanti. (2020). An Analysis on Higher Order Thinking Skill (HOTS) in Compulsory English Textbook for the Twelfth Grade of Indonesian Senior High Schools. *Journal of English Education and Teaching (JEET)*. Volume 4 no 2, p 170-183

- Fisher, & Nancy. (2007). *Checking for Understanding: Formative Assessment Techniques for Your Classroom*. USA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD)
- Gilbert, B & Wolf. (2002). *According to The Book*. Springer Science and Business Media: New York
- Grabe, W. (2009). *Reading in a Second Language*. New York: Cambridge University
- Gupta, M & Jyoti, A. (2014). Cooperative Integrated Reading Composition (Circ): Impact on Reading Comprehension Achievement in English among Seventh Graders. *IMPACT: International Journal of Research in Humanities, Arts and Literature (IMPACT: IJRHAL)*. <http://www.impactjournals.us>
- Harmer, J. (2007). *The Practice of English Language Teaching*. Edinburgh. Pearson Education Ltd.
- Igbaria, A. K. (2014). A Content Analysis of the WH-Questions in the EFL Textbook of "Horizons". *International Education Studies*, 6(7), 200-224
- Ilma, F. (2018). An Analysis of Reading Tasks in Bright Course Book for the Seventh Grade of Junior High School of curriculum 2013, Published by Erlangga in The Year of 2016. Education and Teacher Training Faculty at Walisongo State University.
- Jobrack, B. (2012). *The Tyranny of Textbook an Insider Expose how Educational Materials undermine reforms*. USA: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers
- Kemendikbud. (2017). *Modul Penyusunan Soal Higher Order Thinking Skill (HOTS)*. Jakarta: Direktorat Pembinaan SMA Ditjen Pendidikan Dasar dan Menengah.
- Margana, & Widyantoro, A. (2017). Developing English Textbooks Oriented to Higher Order Thinking Skills for Students of Vocational High Schools in Yogyakarta. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, Vol. 8, No. 1, pp. 26-38. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0801.04>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2018). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook (4th ed.)*. SAGE Publications.
- Mursyid, & Kurniawati, N. (2019). Higher Order Thinking Skills Among English Teachers Across Generation in EFL Classroom. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, 7(2), 119–124. <https://doi.org/10.25134/erjee.v7i2.1775>
- Mutrofin, L., Nur, M., & Yuanita, L. (2017). Developing Teaching Materials Using 5e Model of Instruction to Increase Students' Higher Order Thinking Skills. *Jpps Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Sains*.
- Nanda, M. R. D., Harahap, A. & Damayanti, I. (2019). An Analysis of Language Skills' Proportion in The English Textbook Grade XII Published by Kemendikbud 2014. *Journal of English Education and Teaching*. 3(4). 438-451.
- Rahmawati, L. (2018). A content analysis of the English textbook "Primary English as a second language". *Thesis: UIN Sunan Ampel*
- Rahpeyma, A & Khosnood, A. (2015). The Analysis of Learning Objectives in Iranian Junior High School English Textbook based on Revised Blooms' Taxonomy. *International Journal Education & Literacy Studies*, 3(2), 44-

- Retnawati, H., Djidu, H., Kartianom, Apino E., Risqa D.& Anazifa. (2018). Teachers' knowledge about higher-order thinking skills and its learning strategy. *Problems of Education in the 21st Century* Vol 76, NO. 2, 21
- Seman, S. C., Yusoff, W. M. W., & Embong, R. (2017). Teachers Challenges in Teaching and Learning for Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) in Primary School. *International Journal of Asian Social Science*, 7(7), 534–545. <https://doi.org/10.18488/journal.1.2017.77.534.545>
- Sing, R, K., & Shaari, A, H. (2019). The analysis of higher order thinking skills in English reading comprehension test in Malaysia. *Malaysian Journal of Society and Space*, 15 issue 1 (12-26)
- Sucipto, S., & Septian D.C. (2019). A content analysis of the reading activities in “Bright 2” an English textbook for junior high school students. *English Language Teaching Educational Journal*, 2(1), 13-21.
- Tantra, D.K & Riadi. (2020). Students' Reading Competency on High Order Thinking Items in The Junior High Schools. *Journal of Educational Research and Evaluation*. 4 (3), 266-273
- Tarman, B., & Kuran, B. (2015). Examination of the cognitive level of questions in social studies textbooks and the views of teachers based on Bloom Taxonomy. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 15(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.12738/estp.2015.1.2625>
- Tyas, M. A., Nurkamto, J., Marmanto, S., & Laksani, H. (2019). Developing higher order thinking skills (HOTS) – Based questions: Indonesian EFL teachers' challenges. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Future of Education*, 2(1), 52–63. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.17501/26307413.2019.2106>
- Valdev Singh, R. K., & Shaari, A. H. (2019). The analysis of Higher Order Thinking Skills in English reading comprehension test in Malaysia. *Malaysian Journal of Society and Space*, 15 (01), 12-26. <http://doi.org/10.17576/geo-2019-1501-02>
- Wulandari, I. A. (2016). A Content Analysis of Reading Comprehension Questions in English Texbook based on Revised Bloom's Taxonomy. Thesis
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Designs and methods (6th ed.)*. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Yoke, S., Hasan, H., Jangga, R. & Kamal, M. (2015). Innovating with HOTS for the ESL reading class. *English Language Teaching; Vol. 8, No. 8*. Canadian Center of Science and Education
- Yusoff, W. M. W., & Seman, S. C. (2018). Teachers' knowledge of higher order thinking and questioning skills: A case study at a primary school in Terengganu, Malaysia. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 7(2), 45–63. <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARPED/v7-i2/4120>
- Zaiturrahmi, K., & Zulfikar, T. (2017). Analysis of Instructional Questions in an English Textbook for Senior High School. *English Education Journal (EEJ)*, 8(4), p536-552.