



**NATIVE AND NON-NATIVE ENGLISH SPEAKING TEACHERS:
PESANTREN STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS IN INDONESIA**

THESIS

**BY
IMRA'ATUS SHALIHAH
NPM 21902073019**



**UNIVERSITY OF ISLAM MALANG
GRADUATE PROGRAM
ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING STUDY PROGRAM
2021**

ABSTRACT

Shalihah, I. (2021). *Native and Non-Native English Speaking Teachers: Pesantren Students' Perceptions in Indonesia*. Thesis, English Language Education Study Program, Postgraduate Program, University of Islam Malang. Advisor: Prof. Drs. H. Junaidi Mistar, M.Pd., Ph.D.

Keywords: NEST, non-NEST, perception, pesantren.

English has grown to be the most widely studied and used language internationally due to the increasing number of learners in the process of globalization. With the increasing demand for English language education, the competence of English teachers as native English speaking teachers (NESTs) and non-native English speaking teachers (NNESTs) has become a significant topic of discussion.

The purpose of this study was to explore the students' perception about the advantages and disadvantages learning with NEST and NNEST at the classroom teaching and learning in SMA plus Bustanul Ulum in Jember East Java Indonesia. This school was inviting NEST from America to teach the students by collaborating with the Peace Corps. This qualitative study used focus group interview approach with interview design in collecting the data. A semi-structured online interview was carried out with 10 students.

The finding of this research showed that students' perception about the advantages learning with NEST are; can learn accurate pronunciation, practice speaking fluently, enrich vocabularies, provide opportunities for students to learn English to experts, learn and share other cultures. It makes students feel motivated and wanted to study English more deeply. On the other hand, the study also revealed several disadvantages of NEST which are concerned with teaching grammar. Then, in the cultural aspect, most students do not like NEST because she has different religion and culture with the students.

Another findings about the advantages learning with NNEST. They are; students can learn grammar well and NNEST understand the needs and learning difficulties of students. So, they felt comfortable for asking something they didn't understand to NNEST. Moreover, students felt comfortable because of having the same culture, religion, habits, and appearance. That matter can make students revealed that learning English with NNEST increases their motivation. In contrast, the disadvantages of NNESTs as perceived by the students included their inaccurate pronunciation and lacks a lot of vocabularies. Furthermore, students cannot learn or share new culture. So, their insights and experiences are not increase.

ABSTRAK

Shalihah, I. (2021). *Native and Non-Native English Speaking Teachers: Pesantren Students' Perceptions in Indonesia*. Thesis, Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Program Pascasarjana, Universitas Islam Malang, Pembimbing: Prof. Drs. H. Junaidi Mistar, M.Pd., Ph.D.

Kata kunci: NEST, non-NEST, persepsi, pesantren.

Bahasa Inggris telah berkembang menjadi bahasa yang paling banyak dipelajari dan digunakan secara internasional karena meningkatnya jumlah pembelajar dalam proses globalisasi. Dengan meningkatnya permintaan akan pendidikan bahasa Inggris, kompetensi guru bahasa Inggris sebagai guru berbahasa Inggris asli (NESTs) dan non- -guru penutur asli bahasa Inggris (NNESTs) telah menjadi topik diskusi yang signifikan.

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk menggali persepsi siswa tentang kelebihan dan kekurangan pembelajaran dengan NEST dan NNEST pada pembelajaran di kelas di SMA Plus Bustanul Ulum, Jember, Jawa Timur, Indonesia. Sekolah ini mengundang NEST dari Amerika untuk mengajar siswanya dengan bekerjasama dengan Peace Corps. Studi kualitatif ini menggunakan pendekatan focus group interview dengan desain wawancara dalam pengumpulan datanya. Wawancara online semi terstruktur dilakukan dengan 10 siswa.

Temuan penelitian ini menunjukkan bahwa persepsi siswa tentang keuntungan belajar dengan NEST adalah; dapat belajar pengucapan yang akurat, berlatih berbicara dengan lancar, memperkaya kosakata, memberikan kesempatan kepada siswa untuk belajar bahasa Inggris kepada para ahli, belajar dan berbagi budaya lain. Hal tersebut membuat siswa merasa termotivasi dan ingin mempelajari bahasa Inggris lebih dalam. Di sisi lain, penelitian ini juga mengungkapkan beberapa kelemahan belajar bersama NEST yang berkaitan dengan pengajaran tata bahasa. Kemudian pada aspek budaya, sebagian besar siswa tidak menyukai NEST karena memiliki perbedaan agama dan budaya dengan siswa.

Temuan lainnya adalah tentang keuntungan belajar dengan NNEST. diantaranya; siswa dapat belajar grammar dengan baik dan NNEST memahami kebutuhan dan kesulitan belajar siswa. Sehingga mereka merasa nyaman untuk menanyakan sesuatu yang tidak mereka pahami kepada NNEST. Selain itu, siswa merasa nyaman karena memiliki kesamaan budaya, agama, kebiasaan, dan penampilan. Hal tersebut dapat membuat siswa mengungkapkan bahwa belajar bahasa Inggris dengan NNEST meningkatkan motivasi mereka. Sebaliknya, kelemahan NNEST yang dirasakan oleh siswa termasuk pengucapannya yang tidak akurat dan kurang banyak kosakata. Selanjutnya, siswa tidak dapat belajar atau berbagi budaya baru. Sehingga wawasan dan pengalaman mereka tidak bertambah.

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

This chapter sets out background of the study, research questions, scope of the study, goals of the study, significances of the study, and definition of the key terms.

1.1. Research Context

In the context of EFL in Indonesia, non-native English speaking teachers (NNESTs) are still more dominating than native English speaking teachers (NESTs). Although there is higher number of NNESTs, NESTs seem to be more preferable in the field of English teaching. It is proven by the increasing number of native speakers of English who teach in institutions in Indonesia. As Zaharias (2006) stated that English courses and institutions in Indonesia prefer native-speaker teachers to teach English because they attracted more students. In addition, with the increasing importance of English in the world, the government has made English as a priority for foreign language learning in Indonesia. This shows that English is not only limited to the elite but is expected to be learned by all levels of society. So that the number of schools ranging from kindergarten to university levels that use English as a medium of instruction has mushroomed (Zaharias: 2006).

Not only in formal institutions or courses, learning English by inviting NEST as a teacher also takes place in Islamic boarding schools (pesantren). The place which is known as a center for Islamic religious learning is also trying to improve the quality of learning English for its students. Like one of the pesantren

named Bustanul Ulum, located in Jember, East Java, Indonesia. This Islamic boarding school has several institutions. One of them is a senior high school named SMA plus Bustanul Ulum. This school invited a volunteer (NEST) by collaborating with the Peace Corps for two years. But due to the COVID-19 pandemic, this agreement was only run for six months, and the NEST had to go home to her home country, America.

During NEST was teaching at this school, she was given an opportunity to teach grades X and XI and was accompanied by NNEST (the teacher of that school). NEST was also given the opportunity to teach students outside the classroom, such as guiding students who would join competitions at the district level, or guiding students who would perform at school events.

The fact that happened in class, when NEST finished explaining the material or talking something, NNEST always repeated NEST's explanation in her own words. Sometimes she used English, and sometimes she mixed it with English and Indonesian. It could make students more understood and felt more satisfied in getting an explanation. When NEST guided students outside of class, she always carried a dictionary with her. When she spoke and the students didn't understand, she would translate some words into Indonesia.

Learning and teaching a foreign language, regularly, has been predicated on the difference between native and non-native speakers (Davies, 1991). Native speakers have tended to be viewed as the model such as it has identified by Braine (2010) and Kirkpatrick (2010) that a perception in the English language teaching profession that native English speaking teachers (NESTs) are the ideal model for

language production. They have more improvement than non-native speakers and are often outlooked around the world as the embodiment of the English standard (Wu & Ke, 2009). Even, according to Howard (2019), in his research in South Korea, revealed that native-speaking English teachers are very distinguished from non-native teachers. They are respected and receive better salaries despite having a lighter workload than non-natives. Otherwise, non-native English-speaking teachers (NNESTs) are considered as teachers who have imperfect grammar, pragmatic, and cultural knowledge of the English language (Mahboob, Uhrig, et al. 2004).

It is different from a statement delivered by Seidlhofer (1999) that non-native English speaking teachers as ‘double agents’ have the advantages to share the language they usually use at home and culture to the students. As such, they are suitable agents that facilitate learning by mediating between different languages and cultures through appropriate pedagogy. In addition, NNESTs have experiences in learning the language, so that they can develop a high level of awareness of the learners.

There are some studies about the role of NESTs and NNEST in the ELT context from the students’ point of view. As a research conducted by Sung (2014), found that NESTs have strength on using interactive teaching styles and their accurate in pronunciation, but have weaknesses in teaching grammar and examination skills. On the contrary NNESTs were perceived by the students to be competent in the teaching of grammar and examination strategies, but low in teaching style. They use conventional teacher-centered teaching methods and their

inaccurate pronunciation. In line with this, Jieying and Gajasen (2018), found that NEST was only effective in teaching culture, speaking, pronunciation, but they had problems in communicating with students. Meanwhile NNESTs are more effective in teaching grammar, writing and reading.

From the picture above, it made me curious about the students' perceptions when they taught by NEST and NNEST.

1.2. Research Question

Therefore, in order to describe the overview, this study is conducted under the following research questions;

1. What advantages and disadvantages do learners identify about learning English from a native English-speaking teacher?
2. What advantages and disadvantages do learners identify about learning English from a non-native English-speaking teacher?

1.3. Scope of the Study

The issue about perception towards native and non native English teachers also occurs in pesantren in Indonesia where EFL learners had occasionally to be tauhgt by both native and non-native English teachers. More distinctively, it happened in senior high school level under the auspices of the Bustanul Ulum Islamic boarding school which is located in Jember, East Java, Indonesia. The name of that senior high school is SMA Plus Bustanul Ulum. This school was chosen because the students were taught by NEST from America for six months and she was accompanied by NNEST of that school.

Following that issue, this study focuses on the perceptions of pesantren students toward native and non-native English speaking teachers specifically this study attempts to how the students perceive native and non-native English speaking teachers at the classroom teaching and learning in pesantren.

It could extend our understandings of the issue of native and non native teachers in language classroom and whether the common perception that native English speakers are better than non native English teachers are also prevailed in students of pesantren.

1.4. Goals of the Study

The goal of this study is to find the answers of the questions above, that is to get clear explanations about the students perception towards NESTs and NNETs at the classroom teaching and learning in one of the pesantren in Jember East Java Indonesia. Exclusively questioning the perceiving of students about the advantages and disadvantages of learning English with native and non-native English speaking teachers.

1.5. Significances of the Study

Based on the goals of study above, theoretically, this study reveals perceptions of students of pesantren toward NETs and NNETs in L2 learning in Indonesia, which must be a consideration for teachers in order to achieve learning objectives. These findings also broaden the conversation about middle school students' perceptions of NETs and NNETs in L2 learning in Indonesia, which seem sporadic. This study opened up opportunities for students of pesantren to express their opinions about NETs and NNETs in their L2 learning experiences.

Practically, I hope that the next researchers will be inspired to conduct research on students' perceptions of L2 learning from another point of view which will be a factor in developing innovation in L2 learning.

1.6. Definition of Key Terms

To avoid misunderstanding to the readers in this study, the researcher gives explanation about the key terms that are defined as below;

1. Perception.

In this study, perception is the act of recognize or interpretan experience about events or things by students, in this case the experiences of students when taught by native and non-native English speaking teachers.

2. Native English speaking teacher (NEST).

NEST is an English teacher whose first language is English. The term native English teacher is most often used for English teacher who teach his language to students which English is their second or foreign language. In this study, the native English speaking teacher is from America.

3. Non-native English speaking teacher (NNEST).

NNEST is an English teacher whose first language is not English. He studies and teaches English as a second, third, or foreign language. In this case, the NNEST's first language is Indonesian.

4. Pesantren.

Pesantren or Islamic boarding schools in the past were known as learning centers that only focused on religion. But nowadays many pesantren also



provide opportunities for students to study science in formal institutions.

Pesantren in this study, oversees the institutions of junior and senior high school.



CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Conclusion

The responses and comments received from participants indicate several advantages and disadvantages related to learning English with NEST. In fact, the advantages of studying with NEST for pesantren students include; can learn accurate pronunciation, can practice speaking fluently with the native teacher in the class, can enrich vocabularies, provide opportunities for students to learn English to experts, can learn and share other cultures. It makes students feel motivated and wanted to study English more deeply and they also feel that it is a good chance. On the other hand, the study also revealed several disadvantages of NEST which are concerned with teaching grammar. Then, in the cultural aspect, most students do not like NEST because she is not the same religion and culture with them. So, some students feel unmotivated learning with NEST.

Another responses and comments received from participants are about the advantages and disadvantages learning English with NNEST. The finding indicated that the advantages learning with NNEST are students can learn grammar well and NNEST understand the needs and learning difficulties of students. So, students felt comfortable for asking something they didn't understand to NNEST. Moreover, students feel comfortable because of having the same culture, religion, habits, and appearance. That matter can make students revealed that learning English with NNEST increases their motivation. In contrast, the disadvantages of NNESTs as perceived by the students include their inaccurate

pronunciation and lacks a lot of vocabularies. Furthermore, students cannot learn or share new culture. So, their insights and experiences are not increase.

5.2 Recommendations

Based on the finding, this study gives useful information about pesantren students' perceptions of learning English with NEST and NNEST to help both teachers improve the quality of their teaching. From pedagogical aspect, NEST should try to simplify her explanation of grammar so that it is easy for students to understand. Then in terms of culture, NEST needs to try to adjust the culture of students, especially in the context of pesantren. On the other hand, NNEST should try to learn speaking and pronunciation deeply, so that when she is teaching, she does not often make mistakes. Also, NNEST should know more about the culture of the English speaking country, in order to broaden students' insights about new things related to English.

For the future study, researchers should expand this research by examining modern Islamic boarding schools in other parts of Indonesia. Because in modern Islamic boarding schools, foreign languages (Arabic and English) are very much encouraged and even become an excellent program at the pesantren, and students' way of thinking tends to be more positive towards NEST. This can determine the extent to which pesantren students' perceptions of native and non-native English teachers will be similar or different.

REFERENCES

- Alseweed, M.A. (2012). University students' perceptions of the influence of native and non-native teachers. *English Language Teaching*, 5(12), 42–53.
- Ary, D., Jacobs, L. C., Sorensen, C., & Razavieh, A. (2010). Introduction to research in education 8th edition. *Canada: Wadsworth Cengage Learning*.
- Benke, E., & Medgyes, P. (2005). Differences in teaching behaviour between native and nonnative speaker teachers: As seen by the learners. In E. Llorca (Ed.), *Nonnative language teachers: Perceptions, challenges and contributions to the profession* (pp. 195-215). New York, NY: Springer.
- Bloomfield, L. (1933). *Language*. New York, NY: Holt Rinehart Winston.
- Boyle, J. (1997). Native-speaker teachers of English in Hong Kong. *Language and Education*, 11(3), 163–181.
- Braine, G. (2010). *Nonnative speaker English teachers: Research, pedagogy and professional growth*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Butler, Y. G. (2007). How are non-native English speaking teachers perceived by young learners? *TESOL Quarterly*, 41, 731–755.
- Cook, V. (2005). Basing teaching on the L2 user. In E. Llorca (Ed.), *Nonnative language teachers: Perceptions, challenges and contributions to the profession* (pp. 47-61). New York, NY: Springer.
- Davies, A. (1991). *The native speaker in applied linguistics*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Denscombe, M. (2010). *The Good Research Guide*. New York: Open University Press.
- Derwing, T.M., & Munro, M.J. (2005). Pragmatic perspectives on the preparation of teachers of English as a second language: Putting the NS/NNS debate in context. In E. Llorca (Ed.), *Non-native language teachers* (Vol. 5, pp. 179–191). Boston, MA: Springer.
- Dörnyei, Z. (2007) *Research methods in applied linguistics: Quantitative, qualitative and mix methodologies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Elyas, T., & Alghofaili, N. M. (2019). Native english speakers versus non-native english speakers: the impact of language teachers on efl learner's english proficiency. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, 7(2), 27-38.
- Etikan, I., Musa, S. A., & Alkassim, R. S. (2016). Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American journal of theoretical and applied statistics*, 5(1), 1-4.
- Holliday, A. (2006). Native-speakerism. *ELT journal*, 60(4), 385-387.
- Howard, N. (2019). Constructing professional identities: native english-speaking teachers in South Korea. *The Qualitative Report*, 24(7), 1478-1510. Retrieved From <https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol24/iss7/1>
- Iqbal, N., Aftab, H., & Azhar, K. A. (2019). Attitudes of islamic learning and education faculty students towards english language at Karachi University. *JET (Journal of English Teaching)*, 5(1), 38-49.
- Jieyin, L., & Gajaseni, C. (2018). A study of students' preferences towards native and non-native english teachers at guangxi university of finance and economics, China. *LEARN Journal: Language Education and Acquisition Research Network*, 11(2), 134-147.
- Kirkpatrick, A. (2010). *English as a lingua franca in ASEAN: A multilingual model*. Hong Kong, China: Hong Kong University Press.
- Lasagabaster, D., & Sierra, J. M. (2002). University students' perceptions of native and non-native speaker teachers of English. *Language awareness*, 11(2), 132-142.
- Lasagabaster, D., & Sierra, J. M. (2005). What do students think about the pros and cons of having a native speaker teacher. In E. Llorca (Ed.), *Non-native language teachers* (pp.217–241). New York, NY: Springer.
- Levis, J.M., Sonsaat, S., Link, S., & Barriuso, T.A. (2016). Native and nonnative teachers of L2 pronunciation: Effects on learner performance. *TESOL Quarterly*, 50(4), 894–931.
- Ling, C. Y., & Braine, G. (2007). The attitudes of university students towards non-native speakers English teachers in Hong Kong. *RELC journal*, 38(3), 257-277.

- Mahboob, A. (2003). Status of nonnative English-speaking teachers in the United States (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Indiana University, Bloomington.
- Mahboob, A. (Ed.). (2010). *The NNEST lens: Non native English speakers in TESOL*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Mahboob, A., Uhrig, K., Newman, K. L., & Hartford, B. S. (2004). Children of a lesser English: Status of nonnative English speakers as college-level English as a second language teachers in the United States. *Learning and teaching from experience: Perspectives on nonnative English-speaking professionals*, 100-120.
- Medgyes, P. (1994). *The Non-native teacher*. London, England: Macmillan.
- Patel, M. F., & Jain, P. M. (2008). *English language teaching*. Sunrise Publishers and Distributors.
- Rahaman, O. (2010) Teacher as a Key Factor Affecting Learning, Posted: Thursday, <http://searchwarp.com/swa596810-Teacher-As-A-Key-Factor-Affecting-Learning.htm>
- Rahman, F., & Yuzar, E. (2020). Students' perception towards NNESTS & NESTS' teaching styles: a study at state islamic university of Ar-Raniry. *IJELTAL (Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics)*, 4(2), 321-335.
- Ramita, R., & Ratmanida, R. (2020). Students' difficulties in understanding lecturer's explanation: a comparison between native and non-native lecturer. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 9(1), 99-107.
- Rao, Z., & Chen, H. (2020). Teachers' perceptions of difficulties in team teaching between local-and native-English-speaking teachers in EFL teaching. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 41(4), 333-347.
- Seidhofer, B. (1999). Double standards: teacher education in the expanding circle. *World Englishes*, 18(2), 233-245.
- Selvi, A.F. (2014). Myths and misconceptions about nonnative English speakers in the TESOL (NNEST) movement. *TESOL Journal*, 5(3), 573–611.



- Selvi, K. (2010). Teachers' competencies. *Cultura International Journal of Philosophy of Culture and Axiology*, 7(1), 167-175.
- Sikki, E. A. A., Rahman, A., Hamra, A., & Noni, N. (2013). The competence of primary school English teachers in Indonesia. *Journal of education and practice*, 4(11), 139-145.
- Sung, C. C. M. (2014). An exploratory study of Hong Kong students' perceptions of native and non-native English-speaking teachers in ELT. *Asian Englishes*, 16(1), 32-46.
- Tang, C. (1997). The identity of the nonnative ESL teacher. *TESOL quarterly*, 31(3), 577-580.
- Tsou, S. Y., & Chen, Y. (2019). Taiwanese university students' perceptions toward native and non-native english-speaking teachers in EFL contexts. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 31(2), 176-183.
- Wang, L. E., & Fang, F. G. (2020). Native-speakerism policy in English language teaching revisited: Chinese university teachers' and students' attitudes towards native and non-native English-speaking teachers. *Cogent Education*, 7(1), 1778374.
- Wu, K.-H., & Ke, C. (2009). Haunting native speakerism? Students' perceptions toward native speaking English teachers in Taiwan. *English Language Teaching*, 2(3), 44-52.
- Zacharias, N. T. (2006). Native or non-native teachers: A study on tertiary teachers' beliefs in Indonesia. *CELT: A Journal of Culture, English Language Teaching and Literature*, 6(1), 47-62.